

## Muting Labor Discontent: Paternalism on the Michigan Iron Ranges

---

Dr. Terry S. Reynolds  
Professor Emeritus, Michigan Technological University

Corporate paternalism, sometimes called welfare capitalism, was widespread in industrializing America. To attract and hold a reliable labor force, larger companies all over America provided employees with amenities not required by law or negotiated contract, such as low-cost housing, health care, and recreational facilities. Paternalism emerged in the nineteenth century primarily to attract labor to isolated locales. It endured into the twentieth century as one management response to growing tensions in American labor relations. The average number of strikes in the U.S. rose from 71 annually in the early 1880s to almost 2000 annually between 1886 and 1905 and would continue to increase until the 1920s.<sup>1</sup> To combat this growing labor discontent, some employers responded with repression, hiring private armies and spies to break strikes and intimidate labor; labor responded by repudiating capitalism and embracing ideologies that advocated class warfare. Some corporations, however, attempted to find a middle ground between the extremes of corporate repression and class warfare. That middle ground was paternalism.<sup>2</sup>

Paternalism on Michigan's iron ranges did not differ in its fundamentals from paternalism in other American regions and industries. It emerged to attract labor to an isolated area; it endured to attract and hold the “right kind” of labor and to mute labor discontent. It thus serves as illustrative of how paternalism played out in an important mining region on the geographic periphery of the American industrial system.<sup>3</sup>

As in other areas, paternalism on the Michigan iron ranges began as a necessity. When the first iron mining companies began operating in Upper Peninsula Michigan in the late 1840s, they faced the problem of attracting labor to a region far from existing Euro-American settlements. In 1845-1846, when government surveyors and mineral prospectors discovered substantial deposits of iron ore on Michigan's north central Upper Peninsula, the nearest European settlement of any sort – the small village of Sault Ste. Marie -- was about 150 miles to the east. Even permanent, Native American settlements did not exist in the immediate area. Making matters worse, the region did not appeal to settlers. Its soils were thin and rocky. In the summers the region's swamps bred hordes of insects that made life miserable; the bitter winter froze the shores of Lake

Superior and effectively cut the region off from the rest of the world. In such circumstances, mining companies had to provide amenities that companies in more settled areas did not.

Housing was the most important. None existed in the area. To attract miners, particularly married miners, housing was a necessity. Mining companies preferred married miners to single miners, believing married miners were a more stable work force, less inclined to cause problems.<sup>4</sup> Thus, practically all Michigan iron mining companies prior to 1880 erected low-cost, single-family housing to attract married labor. A few examples illustrate the point. On the Marquette Range, the newly formed Marquette Iron Co. in 1864 had 23 dwelling houses with “garden and potato patches attached to each house.”<sup>5</sup> In 1866 the newly formed Iron Cliffs Company had 38 houses, and the Pittsburgh & Lake Angeline Iron Company had dwellings sufficient for 150 men.<sup>6</sup> In 1870 the Cleveland Iron Mining Company owned 57 dwellings, while in 1874 the Lake Superior Iron Company provided 104 houses at its four mining locations.<sup>7</sup> In 1883 the Pittsburgh and Lake Superior Iron Company had 98 residences at Palmer.<sup>8</sup> On the Menominee Range, which did not ship ore until 1876, the Norway mine, in 1880, employed 400 men and had “the full complement of boarding houses and tenements for the accommodation of its employes [sic],” while at the turn of the century the Chapin Mine had about 90 company houses.<sup>9</sup>

Since sufficient married miners could not be secured, companies had to seek out single men as well. For them, companies erected and operated low-cost boarding houses. A few examples will suffice. The Cleveland mine on the Marquette Range had a company-owned boarding house in 1870 and erected another in 1872.<sup>10</sup> On the Menominee Range, the Milwaukee Iron Company had a boarding house at the Breitung mine in 1873 before the region had shipped a ton of ore. As that range began producing in the late 1870s that company’s successor, the Menominee Mining Company, erected boarding houses near its Chapin and Norway mines.<sup>11</sup> On the Gogebic Range, which opened in the mid-1880s, the Palms, among other mines, operated a boarding house.<sup>12</sup>

The quality of company housing varied widely. Since good housing was needed to attract a high quality work force, mining companies had an incentive to provide at least adequate dwellings. In the late 1870s the wife of a mining company superintendent described those she saw as “comfortable” places, where men lived “contentedly with their families.”<sup>13</sup> A Columbia University student working at the Jackson mine in

1881 noted of company houses: “They are simple, but warm and dry, and are quite an improvement on the usual ones not owned by the company.”<sup>14</sup>

Mining companies, of course, did not really wish to be in the housing business. They had no certainty how long their mines would last, so the housing they constructed was usually reasonably sound, but not elaborate. Company construction generally offered no variety, tending toward a standardized style, lot size, and color.<sup>15</sup> Moreover, in times of economic crunch, maintenance could be neglected. This may have been the case with Edith Wicklund Peterson’s company house. She lived in the Chapin Location of Iron Mountain and noted that the windows in her house needed putty so badly that they had to be washed inside and outside at same time to keep the panes from falling out.<sup>16</sup> Nonetheless, a 1920 government study found that the region’s company housing differed “in no particular from the houses erected by individuals for their own use,” that they were built as substantially as other houses in the region, and that they were “generally well maintained.”<sup>17</sup>

What made company houses attractive to employees, however, was not the quality, but the low rent – typically \$1 per room per month. In areas around mines in full operation, demand for company housing was “so great” that they were “rarely” vacant.<sup>18</sup> Companies generally set rents for their houses “at cost or even less,” often charging just enough rent to cover maintenance and less than rents charged by private owners.<sup>19</sup>

Company stores were a second important aspect of early paternalism on Michigan's iron ranges. Since Michigan’s iron mines emerged in areas that had no pre-existing mercantile establishments, the early iron ore companies had to provide the means for employees to purchase the necessities of life. Typically their stores set prices no greater (and sometimes less) than mercantile establishments would have. Moreover, company stores tended to extend credit more readily than private establishments, either because they knew the miner better or, more likely, had the ability to tap into his paycheck to insure repayment.<sup>20</sup>

Examples of company stores, like examples of company housing, are numerous, especially on the early Marquette and Menominee ranges.<sup>21</sup> On the Marquette Range, the Pioneer Iron Company opened a store in Negaunee in 1858.<sup>22</sup> In 1872 the new Republic Mine, located miles from most producing mines on the Marquette Range, opened a store for the convenience of company employees.<sup>23</sup> On the Menominee Range, in the early 1880s the Penn Iron Mining Company opened two stores -- one at Vulcan and one at Norway.<sup>24</sup> The Chapin, on the same range, also had a company store.<sup>25</sup> On the Gogebic Range, which first shipped ore in

1884, private mercantile providers emerged so quickly after the first mines began to produce that company stores were less necessary and thus less common.

In some regions of the United States, such as the anthracite mining area of eastern Pennsylvania, mining companies used company stores to exploit a captive labor force.<sup>26</sup> In Michigan's iron mining areas, however, companies usually provided stores not to exploit, but to attract and hold a workforce. Men working for the Cleveland mine, for example, early had to travel three miles to Negaunee or trade at the Lake Superior Company's store a mile away from the Cleveland location. Thus the company's local agent Jay Malone wrote to company President John Outhwaite in 1867: "I am only anxious to get a store at the mines that will be a credit to the location and that will give satisfaction to the men."<sup>27</sup> In 1874 the Champion Iron Company on the Marquette Range decided to abandon the idea of making a profit off its store. "Owing to our remote location, it is necessary to keep a store for the men; and by only keeping a stock of staple articles, such as food and coarse clothing, it is no expense to the company, and will pay a fair rate of interest on the investment."<sup>28</sup> The Pittsburgh and Lake Superior Company opened a store in the early 1880s so its employees didn't have to walk five miles to Negaunee for supplies. The company's policy was to run its store and meat market "more as a convenience to its employes [sic] than as a source of profit."<sup>29</sup> Companies also, of course, placed certain restrictions on their stores -- most frequently prohibition of alcohol sales.<sup>30</sup> Company stores, however, could also be profit centers. The stores at several mining locations made a profit even as their parent mining ventures lost money.<sup>31</sup>

As permanent settlements grew up near successful iron mines, the rationale for company stores evaporated. They increasingly became sources of contention, causing ill will with the local mercantile community and discontent among employees. As a result, companies often sold their stores as soon as practical. In 1877 the Cleveland Iron Mining Company leased its store building to an outside contractor, seeing this as a way to be "clean of all complications" and "attend strictly to our mining."<sup>32</sup> In 1876 the Champion Iron Company sold its store to independent merchants, roughly a dozen years after starting it.<sup>33</sup> The Republic Iron Company sold its store's merchandise and leased its store building to private interests in 1875, only three years after its opening, to avoid "the annoyance and disadvantages incident to its continued

prosecution by the Company.”<sup>34</sup> One of the largest and most financially profitable of the company stores on the Michigan iron ranges was that of Iron Cliffs, founded in 1867, located in Negaunee, and serving not only Iron Cliffs’ employees but the general public. In 1883 the local agent for Iron Cliffs noted that while there was “no doubt” a necessity for the company’s store when it started, that necessity “had ceased some years ago.” Now, he contended, “the store is a great source of trouble and is the means of causing a great deal of opposition to the company not only from merchants but from private citizens who may have purchased goods from us and felt aggrieved in some way or another. Our own men also find a great deal of fault with it from the mining Captains down to the laborers.” “We ought now,” he concluded, “to follow the example of every corporation that has kept a store in this district and abolish ours.”<sup>35</sup> Four years later, Iron Cliffs did just that.<sup>36</sup> In 1886 the Menominee Mining Company closed its store at the Chapin mine, a move “hailed with glee” by merchants of Iron Mountain who “always looked with disfavor on company stores.”<sup>37</sup> In 1902 the Penn Iron Mining Company, on the Menominee Range, created a separate entity to manage its stores. A local newspaper reported: “This [the Penn’s action]...marks the disappearance of the last of the so-called ‘Company’ stores in this peninsula ...source of much adverse comment by other merchants.”<sup>38</sup>

The paper was not quite right. When the Mineral Hills district of the Menominee Range near Iron River opened in the early 1910s, the captain of the Forbes Mine ran a small store at the rear of the Forbes Club House for the convenience of his employees. However, when merchants from nearby Iron River began to make deliveries to the area and automobile ownership spread, he closed the store.<sup>39</sup> On the Gogebic Range a company store at the Palms-Anvil location still operated in 1921, but it was conducted on a non-profit basis, its requirements for supplies handled through the mining company’s warehouse.<sup>40</sup> Despite these exceptions, the company store was a rarity on Michigan’s iron ranges by 1890. In fact, an observer on the Marquette Range in 1887 argued that the very friendly feelings between local merchants and the mining companies could be explained in part by the absence of company stores.<sup>41</sup>

A third necessity – besides housing and stores -- that early mining companies felt obligated to provide to attract and retain labor was physicians and health care. Practically every early Michigan iron mining company with aspirations to long-term stability and growth retained a company doctor, and some established a

small company hospital.<sup>42</sup> Practices on the Menominee Range were typical. The leading producer on the range was the Chapin Mine in Iron Mountain. The company owning the Chapin retained John Cameron and J. A. Crowell as the mine's physicians in 1882.<sup>43</sup> A few years after, the Chapin built its own hospital and added two nurses. In 1889 the nearby Luddington mine constructed a hospital to care for non-Chapin employees.<sup>44</sup> Examples from the other two ranges abound. On the Marquette Range, for instance, the annual report for the Champion Iron Company in 1884 noted the construction and furnishing of a hospital for the care of men injured at the mine, and indicated that it was "a want long felt."<sup>45</sup> On the Gogebic Range, Dr. J. A. McLeod moved to Ironwood in 1887 as mine physician to the Metropolitan Iron and Land Company, then a major actor on the Gogebic. He pushed his company to establish the region's first hospital at Ironwood – the Union Hospital.<sup>46</sup>

To pay for employee medical expenses and the company physician, Michigan iron companies generally assessed miners \$1 a month, which covered "all charges for medical and surgical services and all medicines for the entire month" for miners and their families. These funds were turned over to the physician who held the contract to serve the company.<sup>47</sup>

In cooperation with their work forces, Michigan iron mining companies also supported mutual benefit funds, which were designed to provide financial relief to miners suffering work-related injuries or lost-time sicknesses or to provide financial relief to their surviving families in case of fatal accidents. Generally, each employee contributed a set amount, 50 cents was typical, to the fund. The larger mining companies matched employee contributions. In case of accident, sickness, or death, the fund paid out stipulated amounts to the miner or his family.<sup>48</sup> At the Jackson mine in Negaunee, the relief fund was initially handled by employees separate from the company, but after the treasurer absconded with the funds, the mine's paymaster took over as treasurer with the company paying interest on the funds being held.<sup>49</sup>

While housing, stores, and health care formed the focus of early corporate paternalistic activities, iron mining companies sometimes undertook other initiatives. These might include building schools, providing lands for churches, or constructing an opera house to provide an entertainment option to saloons.<sup>50</sup>

Like much of the remainder of America, Michigan's iron mines enjoyed comparative labor peace before 1880, although the Civil War and post-war readjustment and the depression of 1873 led to limited and

short lived strife.<sup>51</sup> Periodic regional labor shortages and generally high corporate profit margins before 1890 gave miners leverage and kept wages relatively high. The 1890s changed things. In 1893 the American economy entered a deep depression. Simultaneously, Minnesota's Mesabi Range began shipping ore. The vastness of Mesabi deposits and the ease with which they could be mined, by open pit rather than shaft mines (the dominant method in Michigan by 1890), caused a glut of ore on an already depressed market. Ore prices dropped from \$6.65 a ton in 1887 to \$2.60 a ton by 1897.<sup>52</sup> Companies responded by shutting down operations or reducing wages in a struggle to survive. Employment in Michigan's iron mines decreased from over 17,000 in late 1892 to 3,500 a year later. Those retaining jobs had their wages severely cut. At one mine the average wage paid to contract miners dropped from \$2.43/day in 1892 to \$1.54 by late 1893.<sup>53</sup>

Making matters worse, in the late 1890s steel corporations began to buy up iron ore mines, wishing to have control of raw material inputs. Steel firms had no interest in high ore prices since they were, in effect, producing ore for their own use and considered ore production secondary to their much more capital-intensive business of producing iron and steel products. Marginal ore producers often could not compete under these changed circumstances. The number of operating mining companies on the Marquette Range declined from 41 to 18 between 1882 and 1897 and would drop further by 1905; on the Menominee the number of mining employers dropped from 25 to 14.<sup>54</sup> By 1900 or shortly thereafter it was clear that the vast ores of the Mesabi and the control of ore by steel companies was likely to keep iron ore prices – and profit margins per ton of ore mined – low for the indefinite future, even as the economy recovered. Low ore prices put a downward pressure on wages, a critical problem for Michigan's underground mines where labor made up an estimated 70 per cent of the cost of the ore coming out of the mines.<sup>55</sup>

Low ore prices, layoffs, wage cuts, and labor policies increasingly set by officials in Cleveland or Pittsburgh, rather than by officials on site, provided the kindling for accelerated labor strife on Michigan's iron ranges. The number of strikes on Michigan's ranges rose from five in the 1870s to 22 in the 1880s to 43 in the 1890s, paralleling the national labor picture.<sup>56</sup> In 1894 a strike on the Gogebic shut down practically all the mines on that range. Strikers and deputies exchanged gun fire, and Michigan's governor dispatched National Guard troops to the district.<sup>57</sup> In 1895 a two-month-long strike crippled the Marquette Range.<sup>58</sup> The emergence of labor organizations capable of paralyzing entire ranges presented iron ore companies with a

dilemma. To survive in the new era of low ore prices and slim profit margins, companies had to mine very large volumes, entailing larger than ever capital investments. To earn a return on these large investments, they had to avoid down time and operating inefficiencies caused by labor turnover and discontent. William G. Mather, president of Cleveland-Cliffs, one of the largest underground iron ore companies in Michigan, recognized that something had to be done to defuse labor disruptions and protect the large capital investments that the new era entailed. Mather had visited mining regions in Europe in the 1890s and noted the better treatment afforded miners there.<sup>59</sup> In 1898 in a presentation to fellow mine managers and executives in the Lake Superior iron district, he argued that if they were to secure peace with labor and secure the steady and efficient output they needed in the new era, employers needed to improve the conditions in which their employees lived and worked, they needed to defuse labor discontent.<sup>60</sup>

Not all mine managers bought completely into Mather's views. To stymie unionization and secure labor peace, some iron mining companies operating in Michigan used a more heavy handed approach. In the aftermath of the 1895 Marquette Range strike, for instance, several companies used a proscription list to rid their forces of prominent union members. Other companies, including Cleveland-Cliffs, used later recession-induced labor cutbacks to purge their forces of "troublemakers."<sup>61</sup> At least one company, US Steel's Oliver Iron Mining Company, was notorious for its elaborate and apparently effective spy system.<sup>62</sup> But, the larger, better-capitalized companies usually coupled heavy-handed actions with a carrot: an expanded paternalistic program. This "new paternalism," which began to emerge around 1890, differed in emphasis from the old. Its emphasis was not so much on providing amenities to attract labor to an isolated area, although this sometimes occurred; the new paternalism's emphasis was on muting the attractiveness of social revolution and unionization to labor.<sup>63</sup>

Some of the elements of the "old paternalism" remained. For example, housing continued to be important. The Oliver Iron Mining Company, which purchased the Champion Iron Company on the Marquette Range and the Chapin on the Menominee early in the twentieth century, owned over 300 houses at Champion and 150 at Chapin around 1920.<sup>64</sup> By 1913 the Corrigan-McKinney Steel Company had built nearly 200 four-to-eight room cottages at its various Michigan mining operations.<sup>65</sup> When Cleveland-Cliffs erected a large charcoal-fueled blast furnace at Gladstone in 1896, one of the first things it did was erect 54



houses for the furnace's workers.<sup>66</sup> In 1936 Cleveland-Cliffs owned around 500 houses at its various mines and furnaces.<sup>67</sup> On the Gogebic Range, company housing accommodated around 100 families at the Newport Mining Company's Palms-Anvil locations near Ramsey. These had space for gardens, gravel walks, picket fences, and some plantings.<sup>68</sup>

Moreover, after 1890 iron mining companies began to pay more attention to housing quality, especially in opening new mining locations. When CCI erected new housing near its Cliffs Shafts mine in 1901, the cottages had indoor plumbing. The mine agent commented: "There is certainly no more partial way of bettering the condition of our employees than by furnishing them good sanitary houses, with pleasant surroundings, at a rental within their means. Such houses increase a man's self respect and make him a better citizen, and I believe a more competent workman."<sup>69</sup> When CCI opened the Austin mine on the Marquette Range around 1905, it erected 40 houses, each "well built," enclosed by a white picket fence with a vegetable garden in the rear. The streets were tree lined.<sup>70</sup> When CCI opened the North Lake region west of Ishpeming in 1908 and 1909, it not only constructed 150 houses but put in attractive lawns, shade trees, electric lights, and a water and sewer system. A professional architect designed the gates on the fences put around the houses; the houses were painted five different colors.<sup>71</sup> At Gwinn, on a newly opened southern extension of the Marquette Range, CCI in 1908 constructed a model company town, retaining Warren J. Manning, a nationally known landscape architect to lay out the town with landscaped streets, parks, and lots. CCI erected a complete water and sewer system, hospital, school, clubhouse, railroad station, and business block.<sup>72</sup> On the Michigan side of the Gogebic Range the Oliver Iron Mining Company in 1908 planned a model suburb with 55 new houses, good rock streets, and cement walks.<sup>73</sup> On the Wisconsin side of the Gogebic the Montreal Mining Company had 118 houses by 1918, all furnished with electrical service, but no other utilities. In the 1920s the company added additional units with electricity, water, and sewer service, while upgrading the older units with basements and water and sewer service.<sup>74</sup> The company generally painted the houses every five years and provided landscaping from a company-owned nursery.<sup>75</sup>

A 1920 government report found 27 per cent of iron mining employees in Michigan and Minnesota were still housed in company-owned dwellings.<sup>76</sup> What about the other 73 per cent? Many of them owned their own homes, even though they were often located on company-owned land, for which they were charged a

low annual rent.<sup>77</sup> Since towns grew up adjacent to many of the mines, by 1920 many miners rented or owned houses in those towns.

Iron ore companies also began to pay more attention to the surroundings of company housing. For example, in areas where city or village officials did not offer regular garbage collection, companies often provided the service.<sup>78</sup> In 1894 Cleveland Cliffs established awards for the best kept premises and best vegetable gardens of their company-owned houses.<sup>79</sup> The Oliver Iron Company later instituted a similar contest.<sup>80</sup> Cleveland-Cliffs officials were convinced the contest significantly improved the appearance of its communities.<sup>81</sup> Between 1895 and 1915 Cleveland-Cliffs went further, actively promoting gardening by experimenting with the best varieties of vegetables and fruits for Upper Peninsula Michigan's climate and creating a nursery to provide plants for beautification projects. The company for a period offered seedlings, landscaping plants, and even fertilizer to its employees at minimal costs.<sup>82</sup>

Cleveland-Cliffs simultaneously made an attempt to clean up and beautify the grounds around its offices and mining sites, also using Warren Manning's services. Manning noted: "The Cleveland-Cliffs Company is among the first mining firms in the country to carry out professionally-made plans of the grounds at their mines."<sup>83</sup>

Expanded housing and related services were accompanied by expanded physician services under the new paternalism. One key element was construction of new and better hospitals, some of which, according to a state agency, were "among the best in the country."<sup>84</sup> In 1918, for instance, Cleveland-Cliffs erected a 50-bed hospital in Ishpeming that was fully state-of-the art.<sup>85</sup> On the Gogebic, iron mining companies, headed by Oliver, erected and equipped a new hospital in 1909; in 1924 Pickands, Mather and the M. A. Hanna Company built a new, modern fireproof hospital at Wakefield on the Gogebic.<sup>86</sup> The Penn Mining Company on the Menominee Range improved its hospital in Norway in 1917.<sup>87</sup> In 1929 the thirteen mining companies operating around Iron River Michigan, jointly established a General Hospital Company to erect a modern hospital at Iron River.<sup>88</sup>

A completely new element in the paternalistic package was a visiting nurse service. Companies hired nurses to visit the homes of employees to carry out routine health checks and offer advice and instruction in sick care, hygiene, and pre-and post-natal care to the wives and dependents of miners. Cleveland Cliffs

initiated its visiting nurse program in 1908. By 1913 CCI had three visiting nurses working under the direction of company-employed physicians. The nurses made 5000 to 10,000 professional home visits annually.<sup>89</sup> CCI used its visiting nurses for multiple functions. In addition to promoting health care and sanitation, they also identified families in need of food, fuel, or clothing and kept track of pensioned employees.<sup>90</sup> At the recommendation of the visiting nurses, in 1908 CCI established a rest home for overworked wives of company employees, since many of these had large families (and some had boarders, in addition) and had never had a vacation. In 1914, to take a typical year, the rest home served 107 guests whose average stay was eight and a half days.<sup>91</sup> By the 1910s visiting nurse programs had become a common element in the paternalistic packages of Lake Superior ore mining companies.<sup>92</sup> Some miners, however, suspected that mining companies were using the nurses to spy on them.<sup>93</sup>

Expanded recreational facilities were also a major element in the new paternalism. Through them, employers hoped to entice mine workers and their families away from saloons and questionable activities by providing what owners regarded as wholesome entertainment and activities. The idea was not completely new. An early example occurred on the Menominee Range at Quinnesec, where the mine owner erected a two-story opera house in the late 1870s, intended to replace saloons, which the company prohibited in the town.<sup>94</sup> The Menominee Mining Company opened a reading room for its employees in 1881.<sup>95</sup>

These early examples of company-sponsored recreation facilities were greatly expanded under the new paternalism. Cleveland-Cliffs took a systematic approach. Before going into the club house business, company president William G. Mather solicited reports from “experts in social matters.”<sup>96</sup> On their recommendation he approached his board of directors in 1905 for support in erecting club houses for company employees. By 1920 CCI had club houses in two of its districts and had financed Y.M.C.A.'s, often in cooperation with other mining companies, in two others.<sup>97</sup> Even the relatively small and isolated American mine on the Marquette Range had a club house.<sup>98</sup> On the Gogebic Range, the Anvil location near Bessemer on the Michigan side had a club house, while on the Wisconsin side of the range the Montreal Mining Company founded the Hamilton Club, which formed “the center of [regional] social activity” with pool tables, four bowling alleys, card and reading rooms, an ice cream parlor, and a “splendid auditorium.”<sup>99</sup> The company club houses were heavily used. For example, Cleveland Cliffs reported in 1921 that the attendance

at the Gwinn Club House and its appendage – a cabin on Bass Lake four miles away with row boats and a dock and associated outdoors activities -- was nearly 104,000 for the year.<sup>100</sup> On the Menominee, the Baltic Mine's club house had yearly attendance of about 20,000, with the daily average around 60 in 1909 and 1910.<sup>101</sup> In an era in which many homes still had no running water, company officials often opened club houses one day a week to women and children for bathing and other activities.<sup>102</sup>

Prior to 1900, few mining companies paid much attention to their dries, the houses where miners changed from dirty mining clothes to street clothes. Most were simple wood structures, with wooden lockers. They often were not heated and did not have bathing facilities. Miners' clothes did not dry between shifts. The new paternalism brought new brick changing houses featuring showers with hot and cold running water, good ventilation, metal lockers, a system to dry work clothes, and, often, comfortable facilities in which to eat lunch.<sup>103</sup> Companies, likewise, began to provide toilet facilities down in the mines themselves.<sup>104</sup>

Safety was also an element of the new paternalism. Cleveland-Cliffs was a leader in this field. Company president Mather saw safety as an essential element in keeping an experienced and contented labor force. In early 1900 he informed his general manager that the company needed some system to "incite" foremen and bosses to promote safe practices and required regular accident reports.<sup>105</sup> A bit more than decade later CCI in 1911 became one of the first American mining companies to hire a full-time safety director, William Conibear. Under Conibear the company became one of the strongest promoters of the "Safety First" movement. Within a few years Conibear replaced miners' candles with carbide lamps, required a telephone in every mine office to summon aid more quickly, and specified that a canary be kept at each mine, a traditional means of detecting poor air quality.<sup>106</sup> Since only 20% of the company's work force was of either American or English origin in the 1910s, Conibear printed safety circulars in multiple languages.<sup>107</sup> He required supervisors to prepare detailed reports on all injuries and deaths and eventually made maintenance of a safe working environment an element in the remuneration of supervisory personnel.<sup>108</sup> In addition, CCI promoted first aid instruction, training more than 1000 of its employees in first aid and establishing five mine rescue stations fully equipped with apparatus.<sup>109</sup> Other companies instituted similar systems.<sup>110</sup> The system apparently worked. In Michigan iron mines the annual fatality rate dropped from 4.6 per 1000 men employed

(1901 to 1910) to 2.75 between (1910 to 1930), and the rate of decline for non-fatal accidents was even greater.<sup>111</sup>

Mining companies had different traditions for selecting mine bosses. Oliver, for example, traditionally drew its mining captains only from academically trained mining engineers. At least one Michigan Range company, however, experimented with promotion from within.<sup>112</sup> Cleveland-Cliffs established an educational department just before World War I to train miners to become electricians and shift bosses. The evening course focused on subjects like mining law, first aid, explosives, ore sampling, geometry, and machinery. Although viewed at first with suspicion, the program gained popularity when the company agreed to select its new shift bosses from graduates of the school.<sup>113</sup> In addition, since CCI's workforce, like the work forces of most of the region's mining companies was largely foreign-born, the company sponsored classes in English at their clubhouses.<sup>114</sup>

Finally, leading ore companies also established pension plans. After a detailed study of costs, Cleveland Cliffs' system, initiated in 1909, provided a small pension for employees who had worked by the company for twenty-five years or more.<sup>117</sup> Oliver Mining Company followed suit shortly thereafter. By 1924 its Chapin Mine on the Menominee range had retired fifty-six employees, whose average monthly pension averaged around \$24.

Mining company paternalism extended to other areas of daily life. In many cities, mining companies built, maintained, or supplied the water to municipal water supply systems. They frequently donated land for churches and sometimes provided them with additional services, such as heat.<sup>118</sup> They supported athletic teams and bands in their mining locations.<sup>119</sup> And in many areas, mining companies built schools for the children in isolated locations.

Various mining companies practiced very specific practices. Mining companies in Iron Mountain, for example, presented employees with a large turkey every Thanksgiving.<sup>120</sup> William Mather for some years provided Christmas presents to children at the large number of timber operations the company had to provide fuel for its charcoal iron furnaces and timber for mine supports.<sup>121</sup> The Morris Mine on the Marquette had an underground Christmas party annually in the 1920s and 1930s.<sup>122</sup> Some companies sponsored sports clubs.<sup>123</sup> On the Marquette range, CCI monitored store prices as a way of deterring store owners from raising prices.<sup>124</sup>

The company also experimented with subsidizing train service from outlying locations to larger towns.<sup>125</sup> When Ishpeming's hotel burned down, S. R. Elliott, manager of CCI mines, helped Ishpeming businessmen to erect a replacement hotel. At the Palms-Anvil location near Ramsay on the Gogebic, the mining company, besides providing housing, a club house, and a hospital, also plowed land for a community farm.<sup>126</sup> Both Cleveland-Cliffs on the Marquette and Oglebay-Norton on the Gogebic established nurseries to supply their employees with shrubs and decorative plants at cost.<sup>127</sup> On the Gogebic, the Oliver Iron Mining company in 1919 built an air field for the area around Ironwood, and company officials were instrumental in securing a Carnegie Library for the city.<sup>128</sup>

Early in the Great Depression of the 1930s, mining company paternalism filled a major vacuum before the introduction of government work and relief programs. Oliver on the Gogebic, for example, allowed employees to cut wood on its properties, turned a blind eye when people took coal from stockpiles, and provided garden plots, plowed the ground, and provided fertilizers to its employees.<sup>129</sup> Cleveland-Cliffs did much the same on the Marquette range – plowing up, fencing, and fertilizing garden plots, providing seed for those who could not afford it, running water lines when drought came, and providing poison when the region was hit by a plague of grasshoppers. In addition, the company issued wood permits to allow employees to secure a wood supply for the winter and helped them transport the wood back home. In 1933 the company provided 1673 gardens and 3043 wood permits. The mining superintendent regarded the projects as among “the most successful and worthwhile...ever undertaken” by the company.<sup>130</sup>

The numerous benefits offered by the new paternalism were, of course, not altruistic. Iron ore companies hoped to gain a healthier, happier, and more stable labor force, keep wages as low as possible, and stave off unionization.<sup>131</sup> Paternalistic practices like housing and improved change houses often simply reflected the prevailing social hierarchy. The houses of mine superintendents were larger and placed more prominently on the landscape than those of the miners, and some dries were constructed so mine superintendents and bosses had separate (and better) changing areas.<sup>132</sup> Companies also frequently used paternalism to influence the morals or politics of their employees. For example, at Gwinn, Cleveland Cliffs placed so many restrictions on the number and type of businesses it would permit in its new model town that New Swanzy, a town filled with saloons, emerged nearby. Club houses were designed to lure miners from

saloons by offering an alternative form of alcohol-free recreation. When this did not work, as at Gladstone, where Cleveland-Cliffs opened a clubhouse around 1903 near its new charcoal furnace, superintendent Austin Ferrell sold liquor in the clubhouse on the grounds that it would be possible to limit intake in the club, but not in commercial saloons.<sup>133</sup> Companies could reward preferred workers with greater access to company houses. Low-cost company housing allowed companies to keep wages lower and, even if not frequently used, the knowledge that companies could use their control over housing to evict undesirables gave corporate leverage. That leverage was used sparingly, but the threat was there and occasionally used.<sup>134</sup>

The visible elements of paternalism were supplemented by a less visible side: the strong influence on the local political, judicial, and financial machinery exerted by mine company officials and their associates, often in a paternalistic manner. The examples are numerous, but one from each of Michigan's iron ranges will suffice to illustrate the point. On the Marquette Range, Charles Stakel served as superintendent at the Republic mine between 1916 and 1925. In 1920, after discovering that both the township and the local school district were deeply in debt, he ran for township supervisor and, making full use of the influence and resources his position as superintendent of the area's sole major employer could bring to bear, was elected. Once elected he cleaned up the township's and school district's indebtedness, improved area roads, rehabilitated the village of Republic's water system, improved the village's ability to fight fires, improved collection of the township's electric and water bills, promoted rural electrification, and actively worked to improve local dairy herds.<sup>135</sup>

Charles E. Lawrence served as superintendent of Pickands, Mather & Co. mines around Caspian, Michigan, on the Menominee Range in the early twentieth century. As manager of the local mines, he erected club houses with reading rooms, showers, citizenship classes, and other amenities for employees and families at the Baltic and Caspian mines. But, like Stakel, he was also active in local policies. He flew the Republican flag from the Caspian shaft house and sent his Lincoln car with chauffeur to pick people up to vote. Elected first president of Caspian in 1918, he held that office almost every year until 1933. He was a director and founder of the Upper Peninsula Development Bureau, promoted various institutions for children, was founder and president of the Iron County YMCA, and president of two local banks at various times. According to one author, "Caspian looked upon him as first citizen."<sup>136</sup> Finally, Oscar E. Olson, chief mining engineer for

Oliver on the Gogebic Range, was by the 1930s serving on the local school board, the hospital board, the board of elders of the Presbyterian Church, and was an official in the Masonic Temple.<sup>137</sup>

Whether it was true or not, miners feared that if they did not vote correctly they could lose their jobs. Harry Larson, who worked on the Menominee Range, noted that at election times "A mining official would run for Township supervisor and would always win out over everyone else. The talk was that if you did not vote for the mining man you would lose your job at the mine."<sup>138</sup>

Superintendents, however, were instructed to maintain good relations with their workforce. In 1905 the outgoing superintendent of the Ashland Mine in Ironwood instructed his young successor to "be *always fair* and almost always cordial and pleasant" with his workers and "never be too busy to give attention to their ease" and ensure they are treated "in every way and all the time...humane and considerate," without regard for nationality, politics, and religion. He was also advised to be a Republican, but, if he couldn't it was okay to be a Democrat, but, he added, "in that case you cannot be so active."<sup>139</sup>

How successful was paternalism? Company officials certainly thought the programs worked in terms of improving living conditions on the mining ranges and the lives of their employees. Cleveland-Cliffs mine superintendents in reporting to corporate headquarters in Cleveland, for example, frequently noted the positive impact of the prizes awarded for best kept premises and best gardens on the appearance of mine locations.<sup>140</sup> They say the activities sponsored in the club houses were "potent factors in increasing the esprit de corps of the employee."<sup>141</sup> The visiting nurse program showed great "direct benefit and value" and was an "efficient agency" in extending sanitation to miners and their families.<sup>142</sup> It was, according to one CCI official, "one of the best avenues we have for the development of good public relations."<sup>143</sup> Similarly, hospitals were considered the "best channel we have for the creation of good will and good public relations in the community."<sup>144</sup> An Oglebay-Norton Company report based on a study of other companies' paternalistic practices claimed that having a welfare director (to direct the paternalistic programs) and visiting nurses was "directly reflected" in decreased labor turn over. The report also suggested that the more attractive a company's properties, the better its chances of attracting "the better class of laborer."<sup>145</sup>

To some extent paternalism worked. From the late 1890s to the early 1940s, almost a half century, labor unions found no foothold on the Michigan Ranges. Fear may have played a role, but paternalism



certainly helped. What made paternalism particularly effective was its ability to split the labor community. Paternalism's obvious benefits made it difficult for labor activists to sell the picture of the corporation as "soulless" parasite. And this encouraged conservative elements within labor to favor a strategy of accommodation rather than confrontation.<sup>146</sup> The words of the wife of a Michigan iron miner on the Menominee Range well express the attractions that paternalism had to some: "They paid small wages but they also provided you with a house, very cheap rent--for instance, our house had four rooms down and four rooms up, and was five dollars a month rent. There was a big garden around it already fenced. We paid a dollar for our lights, a dollar for the water, and a dollar for the doctor. Eight dollars a month was all it cost us for all of them. They call it paternalism now, the unions call it paternalism. But to us, we were quite satisfied with it."<sup>147</sup>

The Great Depression of the 1930s dealt the first major blow to paternalism on the iron ranges. Declining economic conditions eventually led mining companies to cut back on paternal amenities. Cleveland Cliffs provides a very good example. In 1932, with practically no orders for iron ore, CCI reduced pension payments by 50% to many on its rolls and suspended all new additions.<sup>148</sup> The company quit subsidizing Ishpeming's Y.M.C.A., allowing it to close its doors in 1935.<sup>149</sup> Maintenance on the houses it owned lapsed, making company housing less attractive.<sup>150</sup> The superintendent of the Cliffs Shafts mine in 1934 referred to company houses in Ishpeming as "exceedingly shabby."<sup>151</sup> CCI simultaneously began to make increased efforts to get out of the housing business by selling its houses.<sup>152</sup> By 1948 only 15 of 226 miners employed at the Cliffs-Shaft Mine who rented homes rented company-owned homes.<sup>153</sup> The company also abandoned its annual prizes for best kept premises and gardens, although they would be revived briefly later.<sup>154</sup> Likewise, the company dispensed with the services of its landscape architect Warren Manning, who had annually reviewed company mining sites for beautification purposes.<sup>155</sup>

Even more central, however, to the unraveling of paternalism was New Deal legislation that made it easier to organize labor unions and court decisions that prevented companies from establishing company unions as a counter measure. Paternalism was essentially an attempt by companies to find a middle ground between a "big stick" approach and labor radicalization. Labor tolerated that compromise only because it

lacked a viable alternative. When a more acceptable alternative emerged they turned to that. In the late 1930s and early 1940s the United Steelworkers, taking advantage of the new labor legislation, offered that alternative – collective bargaining – and successfully organized virtually all of the Michigan iron mines by overwhelming votes.<sup>156</sup>

With the coming of collective bargaining, iron mining companies accelerated the dismantling of their paternalistic systems, especially after a three-and-a-half-month-long strike in early 1946, the first significant iron mining strike in Michigan in 50 years. In its aftermath – a victory for organized labor -- Charles Stakel, CCI's general manager for mines, announced the closing of the company's North Lake and Gwinn clubhouses, the end of support for the high school at Gwinn, the elimination of donations for firemen's tournaments, bus service subsidies, and gifts to bowling and baseball teams, and termination of prizes for homes and gardens. He also announced that rates for the use of the company hospital at Ishpeming would go up.<sup>157</sup> In the decade following the 1946 strike, Cleveland-Cliffs dropped other elements of its paternalistic system one by one. In early 1947 it discontinued its direct relief efforts to impoverished current and former employees in the form of groceries.<sup>158</sup> In the early 1950s it disposed of its hospital in Ishpeming and shortly after terminated its visiting nurse program.<sup>159</sup> The company also accelerated its sale of company-owned housing. Other companies followed the same pattern. When its miners left the company union to join the United Steel Workers in the early 1940s, Oliver ceased providing free rent, firewood, and other services, putting the money, instead, into the state-mandated unemployment compensation fund.<sup>160</sup> In the late 1940s mining companies around Wakefield and Ironwood withdrew support from the local hospitals they had built, often turning them over to Catholic sisterhoods.<sup>161</sup>

Paternalism was a compromise between the extremes of blatant corporate repression and social revolution that was acceptable to Michigan iron ore companies. For approximately a half century it contributed to labor peace and muted labor radicalization on the Michigan iron ranges. Mining operators dismantled the system only when it became clear that a different compromise would triumph: government-regulated collective bargaining and a constant but controlled struggle between big labor and big business featuring strikes and negotiations.

<sup>1</sup> Florence Peterson, *Strikes in the United States, 1880-1936* (Washington: Govt. Printing Office, 1938), 21.

<sup>2</sup> Good accounts of paternalism in America are Stuart D. Brandes, *American Welfare Capitalism, 1880-1940* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1976) ; Andrea Tone, *The Business of Benevolence: Industrial Paternalism in Progressive America* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1997); and Margaret Crawford, *Building the Workingman's Paradise: The Design of American Company Towns* (New York: Verso, 1986).

<sup>3</sup> In the Lake Superior mining regions, paternalism in copper mining has been covered by Larry D. Lankton in *Cradle to Grave: Life and Death in the Lake Superior Copper Mines* (Cambridge, Mass.: Cambridge University Press, 1991) and *Hollowed Ground* (Cambridge, Mass.: Cambridge University Press, 2010), as well as in his "Paternalism and Social Control in the Lake Superior Copper Mines," *Upper Midwest History* 5 (1985): 1- 18. Arnold Alanen has discussed paternalism in the iron mining districts of Lake Superior in several publications, but with a focus more on the Minnesota iron ranges than those in Michigan. See, especially, Alanen, "Companies as Caretakers: Paternalism, Welfare Capitalism, and Immigrants in the Lake Superior Mining Region," 364-391, in Rudolph J. Vecoli and Suzanne M. Sinke, eds., *A Century of European Migrations, 1830-1930* (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1991), but also "The Planning of Company Communities in the Lake Superior Mining Region," *Journal of the American Planning Association* 45 (1979): 256-278, and "The 'Locations': Company Communities on Minnesota's Iron Ranges," *Minnesota History* 48, no. 3 (Fall 1982): 94-107.

<sup>4</sup> The president of one of Michigan's largest iron ore mining enterprises stated this explicitly in 1898. See William G. Mather, "Some Observations on the Principle of benefit Funds and Their Place in the Lake Superior Iron Mining Industry," *Proceedings of the Lake Superior Mining Institute* [hereafter *PLSMI*], 5 (1898): 17: "We want married men in our employ, because they do not change about from one place to another, as is the habit of unmarried men."

<sup>5</sup> Marquette Iron Co., *Prospectus for the Organization of the Marquette Iron Co. of Lake Superior, Michigan* (New York: L. H. Biglow, 1864), 5.

<sup>6</sup> Iron Cliffs Co., "Financial Statement to Feb. 28, 1866," Folder 1, Box 19, RG 68-102, Iron Cliffs Co. Papers, Archives of Michigan, Northern Michigan University Repository, Marquette, Mich.; Pittsburgh & Lake Angeline Iron Company, *Act of Incorporation, with the Articles of Association, By-Laws, &c. of the Pittsburgh & Lake Angeline Iron Company* (Cleveland: Fairbanks, Benedict & Co., 1866), 22.

<sup>7</sup> Cleveland Iron Mining Co., "Statement of Condition, Inventory, etc., May 18, 1870," Item 2749, MS 86-100, Cleveland Iron Mining Company and Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company Papers, Archives of Michigan, Northern Michigan University Repository, Marquette, Mich. [MS 86-100 is hereafter cited as CIMC-CCIC]. Lake Superior Company figures compiled from the inventory found in *Report, Lake Superior Iron Company, December 31, 1874* (Boston: Rand, Avery, & Co., 1875), 20-23 [copy Longyear Research Library, Marquette, Mich.]

<sup>8</sup> *A Brief History of the Pittsburgh and Lake Superior Iron Company* (Pittsburgh, Penn.: Pittsburgh and Lake Superior Iron Co., 1883), 17.

<sup>9</sup> A. P. Swineford, *The Menominee Iron Range...* (Marquette, Mich.: The Mining Journal, 1880), 19; Michigan, *Fifteenth Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1898)*, 293.

<sup>10</sup> "Cleveland Iron Mining Co., "Statement of Condition, Inventory, etc., May 18, 1870"; Cleveland Iron Mining Co., *Annual Report of the Directors to the Stockholders for the Year ending May 21, 1873* (Cleveland: Sanford & Hayward, 1873), 11.

<sup>11</sup> Mary Louise Dulan, *Born from Iron: Iron Mountain, Michigan, 1879-1979* (Iron Mountain, Mich.: Iron Mountain Centennial Committee, 1978), 26, 44; Swineford, *Appendix to Swineford's History of the Lake Superior Iron District* (Marquette, Mich.: Mining Journal, 1873), 46; Swineford, *Menominee Iron Range*, 19.

<sup>12</sup> Palms Iron Mining Company, *Palms Mine* [New York: the Company, 1890], 10 [copy Library of Michigan]; Michigan, *Fifteen Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1898)*, 300. For a more complete discussion of boarding houses (both company-owned and privately-owned) on Michigan's iron ranges see Paula Stofer, "An Examination to the Socio-Cultural Roles of Boardinghouses and the Boarding Experience on the Michigan Mining Frontier, 1840-1930," PhD dissertation, Michigan State University, 1997.

<sup>13</sup> Mrs. Nelson Powell [Florence] Hulst, "Pioneer Life on the Menominee Iron Range," *Wisconsin Magazine of History*, 7 (1923-1924): 407.

<sup>14</sup> Francis Bacon Crocker and John Bonsall Porter, "The Specular Iron Mines of the Jackson Iron Mining Co., Negaunee, Michigan," Master's thesis, Columbia University School of Mines, 1881, 60.

<sup>15</sup> Albert D. Taylor, "The Montreal Mining Co., Oglebay, Norton & Co. Agents Improvements Report, October 1921," Montreal Mining Company Records, 1921-1931, Wisconsin State Historical Society, Madison, Wis. [hereafter MMC-WiHS]; Michigan, *Twenty-first Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1904)*, 104.

<sup>16</sup> Dulan, *Born from Iron*, 124. For another complaint see E. Clyde and Cordella Trudgen, *Forty-Eight Years in the Iron Mines*, [Marquette, by the authors, 1980], 9.

<sup>17</sup> Leifur Magnusson, *Housing by Employers in the United States* [Bulletin of US bureau of Labor Statistics, no 263] (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1920), 115, 116, 120.

<sup>18</sup> Magnusson, *Housing by Employers*, 122. Michigan, *Fifteenth Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1898)*, 287-300, provides information on rental rates for company houses in Michigan.

<sup>19</sup> "Meeting of the Board of State Tax Commissioners, Negaunee, Mich., Sept. 25, 1913," 20, 40, 55, 59, 70, 72, and 96 in Folder 5, Box 4, RG 83-100, Dept of Natural Resources, Appraisals of Mines and Wells, 1913-1926, Archives of Michigan, Lansing; "Annual Report of the Montreal Mining Company, 1943," 33 (typescript, Iron County, Wisconsin, Historical Society, Hurley, Wis.); "Housing Report for Mining Properties of Oglebay-Norton & Co., August 1921," 19, MMC-WiHS; William G. Mather to C. V. R. Townsend, May 6, 1912, Folder 2, Box 2, R. A. Brotherton Collection, Acc. 03-048A, Michigan Tech Archives and Copper Country Historical Collections, Houghton, Mich.; Michigan, *Twenty-first Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1904)*, 104.

<sup>20</sup> "A New Corporation," *The Current* (Norway, Mich.), June 14, 1902.

<sup>41</sup> For some examples see Quinnesec Centennial Committee, *Quinnesec Michigan Centennial, 1876-1976* [Quinnesec, Mich.: Quinnesec Centennial Committee, 1976], 34, 35; *Mineral Hills Golden Jubilee Historical Album* (Ishpeming, Mich.: Globe Printing, 1968), 64; Dulan, *Born from Iron*, 113; and Kenneth D. Lafayette, *Flaming Brands: Fifty Years of Iron Making in the Upper Peninsula of Michigan* (Marquette: Northern Michigan University Press, 1977), 10, 30. These could easily be multiplied. *Mining Journal* (Marquette, Mich.), May 28, 1870, says that a store built and stocked by mining companies “was...the beginning of a plan which has since been carried out in all the mining locations—that of company’s store for the supply of goods to the employees of the company.”

<sup>22</sup> C. T. Harvey to Wm. Pearsall. May 13, 1858, and May 29, 1858, Folder 38, Pioneer Iron Company Papers, Longyear Research Library, Marquette, Michigan.

<sup>23</sup> Republic Iron Company, *Articles of Association, By-Laws, Etc., of The Republic Iron Company* (Cleveland: Sanford & Co., 1875), 15.

<sup>24</sup> The Vulcan store is mentioned in Swineford, *Annual Review for 1880*, 141; see also Marcia LeMire, *Vulcan 1920 Revisited* (np: by author, 2008), 14-16.

<sup>25</sup> *Dickinson Diggings: The Quarterly Publication of the Dickinson County genealogical Society*, 24, no. 3 (Aug. 2005): 1.

<sup>26</sup> Harold W. Aurand, *From the Molly Maguires to the United Mine Workers: The Social Ecology of an Industrial Union, 1869-1897* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1971), 47f, and Curtis Seltzer, *Fire in the Hole: Mines and Mangers in the American Coal Industry* (Lexington, 1985), 19.

<sup>27</sup> Jay C. Malone to John Outhwaite, April 16, 1867, Item 2792, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>28</sup> Champion Iron Company, *Report of the Treasurer to the Directors of the Champion Iron Company for the Year Ending Dec. 31, 1874* (Boston: Rand, Avery, & Co., 1875), 4.

<sup>29</sup> *Brief History of Pittsburgh and Lake Superior Iron Co.*, 18-19.

<sup>30</sup> *Mining Journal*, Nov. 6, 1869; “The Menominee Ranger” in *ibid.*, July 5, 1879; and Hulst, “Pioneer Life,” 408, illustrate the desire by companies to prevent the sale of intoxicating liquors in their locations. See also C. T. Harvey to Wm. Pearsall., June 11, 1859, Folder 38, Pioneer Iron Company Papers, for the Pioneer Iron Company’s efforts in Negaunee, and Sarah E. Cowie, *The Plurality of Power: An Archaeology of Industrial Capitalism* (New York: Springer, 2011), 72-73, for the Jackson Iron Company’s efforts in the charcoal iron village of Fayette.

<sup>31</sup> A good example is the Washington Mine. In 1866 the mine’s owners relied on profits from the company store to pay two-thirds of their pay roll through the winter of 1866-1867, hoping that by May the mine could pay its own way (“Annual Report to President and Directors of the Washington Iron Company to Dec. 31, 1866,” Box 1, Peter White Papers, Bentley Historical Library, Ann Arbor, Mich.). In 1870 the store’s profits were over \$14,000, while the mining account showed a loss (“Report to President and Directors of the Washington Iron Company for 1870,” *ibid.*). The store’s revenues paid nearly two thirds of the company’s expenses for labor during the winter of 1869-1870 (“Report, Washington Iron Company 1869,” *ibid.*). The company store turned a profit of \$11,792 in 1872 while the company was “barely able to do a living business” (“Annual Report to President and Directors of the Washington Iron Company for 1872,” *ibid.*). In 1870 the Iron Cliffs store sold \$200,000 in merchandise and cleared \$20,000 over expenses at a time when the company had yet to make sufficient money to pay a dividend (E. S. Green to H. Benedict, Jan. 16, 1871, Folder 3, Box 39, RG 68-102, Iron Cliffs Company Papers).

<sup>32</sup> Samuel L. Mather to J. C. Morse, Nov. 16, 1877, Item 2780, MS 86-100, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>33</sup> Champion Iron Company, *Report of the Treasurer to the Directors and Stockholders of the Champion Iron Company for the Year Ending Dec. 31, 1876* (Boston: Rand Avery, & Co. 1877), 7.

<sup>34</sup> Republic Iron Company, *Articles of Association*, 15.

<sup>35</sup> Alexander Maitland to C. J. Canda, Sept. 16, 1883, v. 21, RG 66-36, Iron Cliffs Co. Papers-II, Archives of Michigan, Northern Michigan University repository. See also “Annual Statement of the Iron Cliffs Company for the year ending November 30, 1887,” handwritten document in the historical file drawers in Cliffs Natural Resources headquarters, Cleveland, Ohio.

<sup>36</sup> Iron Cliffs Co., *Annual Statement of the Iron Cliffs Company for the year ending November 30, 1887*, in historical files, Cliffs Natural Resources, Cleveland.

<sup>37</sup> *The Current*, March 27, 1886.

<sup>38</sup> “A New Corporation,” *The Current*, June 14, 1902; LeMire, *Vulcan 1920 Revisited*, 17.

<sup>39</sup> *Mineral Hills*, 64.

<sup>40</sup> “Housing Report for Oglebay-Norton,” 27.

<sup>41</sup> *Daily Iron Agitator* (Ishpeming, Mich.), Dec. 31, 1887.

<sup>42</sup> Lafayette, *Flaming Brands*, 98; C. B. Burr et al., ed., *Medical History of Michigan*, v. 2 (Minneapolis & St. Paul, Minn.: The Bruce Publishing Co., 1930); 549; Dulan, *Born from Iron*, 61-63; E. M. Libby, “The Company Surgeon,” *PLSMI*, 15 (1910): 195-200. A good account of a company physician’s life is Charles Van Riper, *My Father, Doctor Van* (Marquette, Mich.: John M. Longyear Research Library, 1982). It deals with Paul Van Riper, physician to the Champion mine for decades.

<sup>43</sup> George J. Eisele, *History of Chapin Mine: an interesting insight into the growth and development of this industry* [Iron Mountain, Mich.: George J. Eisele, 1923], 9. This was originally printed in the *Iron Mountain News* (Iron Mountain, Mich.), Sept. 7, 1923. Eisele was the assistant superintendent of the mine.

<sup>44</sup> Dulan, *Born from Iron*, 118

<sup>45</sup> Champion Iron Company, *Report, Champion Iron Company for the Twelve Months Ending April 30, 1884* (Boston: Cashman Keating & Co., 1884), 10.

<sup>46</sup> Burr, *Medical History of Michigan*, v. 2, 591.

<sup>47</sup> F. P. Mills to Jay C. Morse, Nov. 11, 1873, Item 2774, CIMC-CCIC; Dulan, *Born From Iron*, 61; Dulan, *Our Frontier Days on the Menominee Range* (Iron Mountain, Mich.: Keep Michigan Beautiful, Inc., 1973), 37; Mather, “Some Observations,” 13-14, 19, and table following 20; Mather, MS speech, May 23, 1904, 2, Folder 34, Container 4, William Gwinn Mather Family Papers, MSS



4578, Western Reserve Historical Society, Cleveland, Ohio. See also Libby, "Company Surgeon,;" Burr, *Medical History of Michigan*, v. 2, 628; "Iron Mountain," *The Michigan Miner*, 1, no. 11 (Oct. 1, 1899): 11; and Michigan, *Twenty-First Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1904)*, 108.

<sup>48</sup> Michigan, *Twenty-First Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1904)*, 109; Mather, "Some Observations," 13-14, 17-19.

<sup>49</sup> Crocker "Specular Iron Mines of Jackson Iron Company," 67-68.

<sup>50</sup> For an examples of lands donated for school construction see, Samuel Redfern to B. Leurzie[?], Feb. 13, 1894, Folder 4, Box 62, RG 68-102, Iron Cliffs Company Papers; Redfern to School Dist. of Maple Ridge, May 3, 1894, *ibid.*; *Quinnesec*, 27-28; and Dulan, *Frontier Days*, 42. *Iron Port* (Escanaba, Mich.), April 16, 1881, mentions that the Chapin mine provided half the cost for a Methodist church at the Chapin Location. On the Gogebic, miners built the Methodist church near the Newport mine, but the Newport Mining Co. furnished the building's heat. The mining company also provided the church with electricity and water (JoAnn Fleming, *Ironwood, Michigan: The Growing Years, 1888-1925* (Ironwood, Mich.: s.n., 1985 ?), 76; C. J. Canda to T. J. Houston, March 26, 1875, Folder 2, Box 34, RG 68-102, Iron Cliffs Co. Papers, for a deed from Pioneer Iron Co. to Trustees of the First Methodist Episcopal Church of Negaunee.

<sup>51</sup> Terry S. Reynolds, "Calm or Conflicted: Labor-Management Relations on the Michigan Iron Ranges, 1855-1904," *Michigan Historical Review*, 33, no. 2 (Fall 2007): 13-14.

<sup>52</sup> Crowell & Murray, Inc., *The Iron Ores of Lake Superior* (Cleveland: The Penton Press Co., 1930), 85 (for 'Old Range' Bessemer ores).

<sup>53</sup> Henry R. Mussey, *Concentration in the Mining Industry: A Study of Concentration in Lake Superior Iron Ore Production* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1905), 124-125; Michigan, *Eleventh Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1894)*, 426, 432.

<sup>54</sup> Mather, "Some Observations," 11.

<sup>55</sup> This was the estimate of Cleveland-Cliffs president Mather in "Some Observations," 12.

<sup>56</sup> Reynolds, "Calm or Conflicted?," 14, table 4.

<sup>57</sup> For the Gogebic range strike see Michigan, *Twelfth Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1895)*, 511-12; *Ironwood News Record* (Ironwood, Mich.), July 7, 14, and 21, 1894; Charles H. Morse to Gov. John T. Rich, July 20, 1894, Folder 10, Box 183, RG 44, Archives of Michigan.

<sup>58</sup> Herbert J. Brinks, "Marquette Iron Range Strike, 1895," *Michigan History* 50 (1966): 293-305; "Marquette Iron Range Strike," in Michigan, *Thirteenth Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1896)*, 350-363.

<sup>59</sup> For example, William P. Blake, "Provision for the Health and Comfort of Miners – Miners' Homes," *American Institute of Mining Engineers, Transactions*, 3 (1874-75): 218-228.

<sup>60</sup> Mather, "Some Observations," 10-20.

<sup>61</sup> "Marquette Iron Range Strike: Miners' History of the Strike," in *Thirteenth Annual Report*, 360-361; Wm. P. Dillingham, *Immigrants in Industries*, v. 16, pt. 18 (Washington: GPO, 1911), 395, 398 [vol. 16, pt. 18 deals with iron ore mining].

<sup>62</sup> See, for example, Frank L. Palmer, *Spies in Steel: An Expose of Industrial War* (Denver: The Labor Press, 1928), 25, 41, 50, 56. Palmer focuses on the Minnesota ranges, but does mention use of the Oliver spy system on the Gogebic Range in Michigan on the pages cited.

<sup>63</sup> For instance, Cleveland-Cliffs managers on the Marquette Range acknowledged in 1915: "We have always to remember that this is a Non-Union district, and unless the companies treat the men fairly and liberally, it will result in their organizing..." H. R. Harris, Austin Farrell, C.V.R. Townsend, and M. M. Duncan to Wm. G. Mather, July 12, 1915, "Wages, Labor" file, Boyum files, Box 2, Cliffs Natural Resources Empire Mine historical records room, Palmer, Michigan.

<sup>64</sup> Meeting of the Board of State Tax Commissioners, "Negaunee, Mich., Sept. 25, 1913, folder 5, box 4, RG 83-100, Dept of natural Resources-Appraisals of Mines and Wells, Michigan State Archives [Champion]; Eisele, *History of Chapin Mine*, 5; "Menominee Range: Operations of the Oliver Iron Mining Company," *Iron Mining and Agriculture: Upper Peninsula of Michigan* [Souvenir Edition of the *Mining Journal*, Marquette, Mich., March 1, 1913], unpaginated [Chapin]. Eisele boasted that Chapin company houses were rented at less than \$6/month, that rents had not been raised in fifteen years, and that there was no charge for water.

<sup>65</sup> "Corrigan, McKinney & Co.," *Iron Mining and Agriculture*.

<sup>66</sup> Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Co. [hereafter CCIC], *Agents' Annual Reports & Statistics, 1908*, v. 2, pt. 1, 13, Item 2089, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>67</sup> Information scattered through CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of the General Manager, 1936*, Item 2007, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>68</sup> Taylor, "Montreal Mining Co. Improvements Report, 1921," 14-15, MMC-WiHS.

<sup>69</sup> CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports & Statistics, 1901*, v. 1, sect. 5, 17, Item 2067, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>70</sup> Arnold R. Alanen, "The Settlements of Marquette County, Michigan," 17, in William H. Mulligan, Jr., ed, *Historic Resources of the Iron Range of Marquette County, Michigan, 1844-1941* (Marquette, Mich.: Economic Development Corporation of the County of Marquette, 1991).

<sup>71</sup> *Iron Ore* (Ishpeming, Mich.), June 19, 1915, and Sept. 15, 1917; Alanen, "Settlements," 14, 20; CCIC, *Agents Annual Reports and Statistics, 1910*, v. 1, pt. 3, 93, Item 2093, CIMC-CCIC; *Mining Journal*, April 26, 1961.

<sup>72</sup> Alanen, "Settlements," 21-25; W. H. Moulton, "The Sociological Side of the Mining Industry," *PLSMI*, 14 (1909): 97; "Swanzy District" and "The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company" in *Iron Mining and Agriculture*; J. E. Jopling, "A Brief History of the Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company," *Michigan History* 5 (Jan-April 1921): 164-165; Harlan Hatcher, *A Century of Iron and Men*

(Indianapolis, Ind.: Bobbs-Merrill, 1950), 226-227; and W. H. Manning, "Villages and Homes for Working Men," *Western Architect*, 16 (August 1910): 84-88.

<sup>73</sup> Fleming, *Ironwood Michigan: Growing Years*, 68 (entry for Oct. 19, 1908).

<sup>74</sup> "Report on Employee Housing at Montreal, 1931," MMC-WiHS, 2 pages. For Oliver's efforts to improve the appearance of its housing see "Menominee Range Operations of the Oliver Iron Mining Company," *Iron Mining and Agriculture*.

<sup>75</sup> "Down 3,000 Feet; See Wisconsin's Noted Montreal Mine," *Milwaukee Journal*, June 25, 1939.

<sup>76</sup> Magnusson, *Housing by Employers*, 115.

<sup>77</sup> For example, Iron Cliffs charged a tenant 50 cents a month in 1891, but could terminate the lease on 30-days notice (Lease for Land at Negaunee, Sept. 23, 1891, Folder 9, Box 2, RG 68-102, Iron Cliffs Papers III). By 1897 some lots leased for \$12-\$20 a year (Rent Ledger, 1897-1903, RG 66-35, Iron Cliffs Papers II).

<sup>78</sup> Moulton, "Sanitation for the Mine Locations," *PLSMI*, 18 (1913): 40-41.; Magnusson, *Housing by Employers*, 120.

<sup>79</sup> Moulton, "Sociological Side, 96; *Daily Mining Journal* (Marquette, Mich.), Jan. 25, 1901; "The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company," *Iron Mining and Agriculture; The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company* (Cleveland: Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Co., 1920), 60.

<sup>80</sup> Charles A. Gulick, *Labor Policy of the United States Steel Corporation* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1924), 176.

Photographs of some of the winning Oliver Mining Company prize houses and gardens on the Gogebic Range are in the Iron Range Research Center in Hibbing, Minnesota.

<sup>81</sup> For example, CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports and Statistics, 1902*, v. 1, Pt. 3 (Mine Agent's Annual Report), 29, Item 2069, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>82</sup> For Cleveland-Cliffs two decade long attempt to promote agriculture on Michigan Upper Peninsula see Terry S. Reynolds, "'Quite an Experiment': A Mining Company Attempts to Promote Agriculture on Michigan's Upper Peninsula, 1895-1915," *Agricultural History*, 80 (2006): 64-98.

<sup>83</sup> "Landscaping on an Iron Range," *Explosives Engineer*, 271-276.

<sup>84</sup> Michigan, *Twenty-First Annual Report of the Bureau of Labor and Industrial Statistics (1904)*, 108.

<sup>85</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of General Manager, 1918*, 729-730, Item 1989, CIMC-CCIC; Hatcher, *Century*, 245.

<sup>86</sup> "Gogebic Range: Operations of the Oliver Iron Mining Company," *Iron Mining and Agriculture*; "New Hospital at Wakefield," *Skilling's Mining Review*, 13, no. 21 (Oct. 4, 1924): 1.

<sup>87</sup> *The Current*, Dec. 23, 1916; Jan. 13, Feb. 3, and Oct. 20, 1917.

<sup>88</sup> See Folder 8, Container 14, MSS 33, RG XIII, Jones & Laughlin Steel Corporation Records, Historical Society of Western Pennsylvania, Pittsburgh, Penn.

<sup>89</sup> For example, CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of the General Manager, 1930*, 535, Item 2001, CIMC-CCIC, reported 9992 visits and 1684 different patients in 1930. This is a fairly substantial number for a company whose annual employment averaged 2088 between 1926 and 1930.

<sup>90</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of the General Manager, 1921*, 607, 614, Item 1992, CIMC-CCIC. *Ibid.*, 1938, 612, Item 2009, indicates that CCI gave special relief to 54 families in the Marquette district in addition to making donations to incapacitated employees.

<sup>91</sup> Moulton, "Sociological Side," 92-93; "The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company," *Iron Mining and Agriculture; The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company, The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company: An Historical Review of This Company's Development and Resources Issued in Commemoration of Its Seventieth Anniversary, 1850-1920* (Cleveland: Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company, 1920), 59-60; Moulton, "Industrial Relations Work of the Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company," in *The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company and Its Extensive Operations in the Lake Superior District* (Cleveland: Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Co., 1929), 49-50; CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports and Statistics, 1914*, Mine Agent, 595, Item 2106, CIMC-CCIC. By 1913 the Oliver Mining Company had also established a rest farm near Ishpeming ("Oliver Iron Mining Company," *Iron Mining and Agriculture*).

<sup>92</sup> Charles E. Lawrence, "Social Surroundings of the Mine Employee," *PLSMI*, 16 (1911): 125. Eisele, *History of Chapin Mine*, 5, indicated that the mine "constantly" employed a visiting nurse who rendered excellent service to families of employees in sick rooms and in welfare work. See also Moulton, "Sanitation," 42. In 1914 a meeting of nurses held in CCI's offices included visiting nurses of the Oliver Mining Company on both the Marquette and Menominee Ranges, as well as nurses employed by Pickands, Mather at Palatka and the Metropolitan Mining Company on the Gogebic. See CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports and Statistics, 1914*, Mine Agent, 589, Item 2106, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>93</sup> For example, Pete Benzoni, *Beyond the Mine: a Steelworker's Story* (Superior, Wis.: Savage Press, 1997), 35.

<sup>94</sup> Hulst, "Pioneer Life," 414.

<sup>95</sup> *Iron Port* (Escanaba, Mich.), Dec. 31, 1881.

<sup>96</sup> Austin Ferrell to William G. Mather, Jan. 17, 1902, in CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports & Statistics, 1901*, Annual Report of Mine Agents, v. 1, sect. 9, Item 2067, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>97</sup> For the approval see CCIC, *Minute Book 1891-1906*, entry Dec. 4, 1905, Cliffs Natural Resources historical records, Headquarters building, Cleveland, Ohio; Moulton, "Sociological Side," 88; and *The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company*, 1920, 60-61. CCI also had a clubhouse near its charcoal furnace at Gladstone, Michigan.

<sup>98</sup> J. R. Thompson, "Report: American-Boston Mining Co.," Aug. 4, 1917, Folder 4 (American-Boston correspondence general), Box 1, Hanna Mining Co. Series 2 papers, Iron County Museum, Caspian, Michigan. The Oliver Iron Company had a club house at the Champion mine on the same range, Van Riper, *Doctor Van*, 10.

<sup>99</sup> For the Anvil mine see Albert D. Taylor, "Montreal Mining Co. Improvements Report," 14, MMC-WiHS; for the Hamilton Club, see Carroll C. Taylor, "The Gogebic Iron Range," *PLSMI*, 25 (1926): 32-33; Mary Woitkieleviz Mossey, "The Iron Ore Miner's Daughter," typescript, Iron County, Wisconsin, Historical Society, Hurley, Wis., not dated; and *Milwaukee Journal*, June 25, 1939.

<sup>100</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of the General Manager, 1921*, 271, Item 1992, CIMC-CCIC.

- <sup>101</sup> Lawrence, "Social Surroundings, 126. Nearby the Caspian mine also had a club house: "Description of Mines on the Menominee Range," *PLSMI*, 16 (1911): 33. See also, Bernie Hoffmann, *Recollections of Old Crystal Falls* (Crystal Falls, Mich.: by the author, c1990): 123, for club houses at Palatka provided by Pickands Mather and Mountain Iron by Oliver.
- <sup>102</sup> Lawrence, "Social Surroundings," 124-125.
- <sup>103</sup> Moulton, "Sociological Side," 91, and "Sanitation for Mine Locations," 38; John S. Mennie, "A New Changing House at the Cliffs Shaft Mine," *PLSMI*, 9 (1903): 121-6; Floyd L. Burr, "The New Change House at Vulcan Mine," *ibid.*, 18 (1913): 211-223; William Kelly, "A New Changing-House at the West Vulcan Mine," *ibid.*, 8 (1902): 70-74; "A Model Dry," *The Current*, Nov. 24, 1910 (Aragon Mine); *Iron Ore*, March 31, 1906 (Section 16 mine, Oliver Iron Co.); Dan S. Young, "A Modern Change House on the Gogebic Iron Range," *PLSMI*, 30 (1939): 147-159; and Albert H. Fay, "Examples of Modern, Sanitary Dry Houses," *Engineering & Mining Journal*, 88 (Oct. 23, 1909): 822-824.
- <sup>104</sup> Moulton, "Sanitation for Mine Locations," 39.
- <sup>105</sup> William G. Mather to M. M. Duncan, Jan 29, 1900, in CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports and Statistics, 1899*, sect. 1, Item 2063, CIMC-CCIC; see also *Agents' Annual Reports and Statistics, 1900*, sect. 1, 56, Item 2064, *ibid.*, where the mine department's general agent reported that having to do regular accident reports made shift bosses more alert to preventing accidents.
- <sup>106</sup> CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports and Statistics, 1914*, Mine Agent, 551 ff., Item 2105, CIMC-CCIC.
- <sup>107</sup> For the ethnic breakdown of CCI's workforce in 1901 see CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports & Statistics, 1901*, v. 1, sect. 4 ½, 57, Item 2067, CIMC-CCIC, which breaks down the 1810 employees of the company in November 1901 by nationality and mine. The leading ethnic groups were 24.7% Scandinavian, 21.9% Finnish, 19.2% English, 10.6% Polish. Irish, French, and Italians composed between 5 and 8% of the workforce each. American's were only 2.5%, and many of those were in the general office or laboratory.
- <sup>108</sup> The company printed safety rule books in three languages: English, Finnish, and Italian. See CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports and Statistics, 1913*, sect.1, 381, Item 2103, CIMC-CCIC. Supervisor remuneration for safety performance was through a "safety bonus" system instituted in 1929. See CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of the General Manager, 1929*, 2, Item 2000, CIMC-CCIC, and William Conibear, "Development of Safety in the Iron Mines of Michigan," *PLSMI*, 29 (1936): 180.
- <sup>109</sup> "The Cleveland-Cliffs Company" *Iron Mining and Agriculture*; "Will Conibear First Mine Safety Inspector," *Mining Journal*, June 29, 1950 [special Cleveland-Cliffs Centennial issue]; William Conibear, "Safety Work at the Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company," 52-55, in *The Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company and Its Extensive Operations* (1929).
- <sup>110</sup> See, for instance, "Final Report. First Conference. Upper Peninsula County Mine Inspectors; Upper Peninsula Company Safety Engineers; Lake Superior Mining Division staff of the United States Bureau of Mines," Houghton, Mich., April 23-25, 1919," 10, 30-33, typescript, Michigan Technological University Archives and Copper Country Historical Collections, Houghton, Mich., and Gulick, *Labor Policy of United States Steel*, 138,143, 151.
- <sup>111</sup> Wm. Conibear, "Development of Safety," 180; see also CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of the General Manager, 1955*, Safety Department, Table III, Item 2026, CIMC-CCIC.
- <sup>112</sup> "Final Report. First Conference." 22.
- <sup>113</sup> F. C. Stanford, "Training of Workmen for Positions of Higher Responsibility," *Transactions of the American Institute of Mining Engineers*, 59 (1918): 612-626; CCIC, *Agents Annual Reports and Statistics, 1914*, 622f; Item 2106, CIMC-CCIC; and *Iron Ore*, July 31, 1915.
- <sup>114</sup> For an example of the classes at the Gwinn clubhouse see CCIC, *Annual Report of General Manger, Mining Dept, 1921*, 620, Item 1992, CIMC-CCIC.
- <sup>115</sup> Moulton, "Sociological Side," 94-96; *Iron Ore*, May 22, 1909. According to CCIC, *Annual Report of General Manager, Ore Mining Dept., 1930*, 524, Item 2001, CIMC-CCIC, 120 pensions were in force at the end of that year. Trudgen, *Forty-eight Years*, 22, complained that the pension was not even enough to buy groceries. *Iron Ore*, April 11, 1914, castigated the Lake Angeline Company for not having a pension system.
- <sup>116</sup> Eisele, "Chapin Mine," 6. For others who initiated pensions see *Lake Superior Iron Co., Semi-Centennial Celebration, Ishpeming, Michigan, June 24, 1903* (Ishpeming, Mich.: *Iron Ore*, 1903), 16. See also "Oliver Iron Mining Company," *Iron Mining and Agriculture*.
- <sup>117</sup> For examples, see *Quinnesec*, 36; *Mineral Hills*, 29, 39, and Dulan, *Born from Iron*, 39.
- <sup>118</sup> For example, on the Gogebic Range, the Newport Mining Company in Ironwood provided land and, for a time, free heat, electricity, and water. See, Fleming, *Ironwood: Growing Years*, 76 (entry for Sept 27, 1913). At Gwinn on the Marquette Range, Mather donated land for a Methodist and a Lutheran church in 1909, provided no liquor be sold on the premises.
- <sup>119</sup> For example Benzoni, *Beyond the Mine*, 47; *Caspian: The Caring City, 1918-1993* (Iron River, Mich.: Caspian Diamond Jubilee Book and Iron County Historical and Museum Society, [1993]), 93-94.
- <sup>120</sup> *Iron Mountain Press* (Iron Mountain, Mich.), Nov. 25, 1897.
- <sup>121</sup> CCIC, *Agents Annual Reports and Statistics, 1905*, v. 1, Sec. 4, 44, Item 2080, CIMC-CCIC.
- <sup>122</sup> "Underground Christmas Parties Part of Morris Mine's History," *Mining Journal*, Dec. 2, 1957.
- <sup>123</sup> Bruce K. Cox, *Oliver's Iron Men Book Four* (Agogebic press, 2008), 1, 3, 4.
- <sup>124</sup> CCIC, *Annual Report for year Ending Dec. 31, 1930, Ore Mining Department*, 571, Item 2001, CIMC-CCIC.
- <sup>125</sup> CCIC, *Agents Annual Reports and Statistics, 1914*, v. 2, 238, Item 2106, CIMC-CCIC.
- <sup>126</sup> Taylor, "The Montreal Mining Co. Improvements Report," 15-16, MMC-WiHS. Cleveland Cliffs leased garden plots, with 1500 leases in force by 1920. See *Cleveland-Cliffs Iron Company* (1920), 42.
- <sup>127</sup> *Iron Ore*, May 28, 1904; Taylor, "The Montreal Mining Co. Improvements Report," 46, MMC-WiHS.
- <sup>128</sup> Fleming, *Ironwood, Michigan: Growing Years*, 99, and "Note," *The Michigan Miner*, 2, no. 11 (Oct. 1, 1900): 23.
- <sup>129</sup> Florence E. Brownfield, *Three Michigan Mining Locations: Chinatown, Monticello, and Reno* (Tustin, Calif.: Florence E. Brownfield, 1996), 10, 74, 164, 166.



<sup>130</sup> CCIC, *Annual Report of the General Manager, Ore Mining Department, 1932*, 2, 33, Item 2003, CIMC-CCIC. That year CCI only employed 631 miners (average employment had been more on the order of 2000-2500). The company extended its garden and wood programs to laid off employees and the surrounding community.

<sup>131</sup> Magnusson, *Housing by Employers*, 21.

<sup>132</sup> For example John S. Mennie, "A New Changing House at the Cliffs Shaft Mine," *PLSMI*, 9 (1903): 124.

<sup>133</sup> CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports and Statistics, 1904*, v. 1, pt. 7, 37, Item 2077, CIMC-CCIC; Mather speech, May 23, 1904.

<sup>134</sup> Dulan, *Born from Iron*, 123-124, reports that in the late 1890s Superintendent McNaughton of the Chapin expelled Joseph Tamborini from Chapin Mine Company housing due to his outspoken political views. Tamborini had to move in the dead of winter, forcing him to sell his cows, pigs, and chickens and find emergency lodging for his wife and daughter. See also *Iron Port*, April 27, 1889, for an accusation that a similar action was taken at Fayette, and Van Riper, *Doctor Van*, 9, for an instance at Champion.

<sup>135</sup> Charles Stakel, *Memoirs of Charles J. Stakel: Cleveland-Cliffs Mining Engineer, Mine Superintendent and Mining Manager* (Marquette, Mich.: Marquette County Historical Society, 1994), 75-97. Stakel continued to be politically active in his subsequent posts. See also, "A Bond of Interest," *Harlow's Wooden Man*, 13, no. 5 (1978): 30, and *Mining Journal*, July 7, 1943. Daniel Homernik, "Late to the Party: The Upper Peninsula in the 1932 and 1936 Elections," *Upper Country: A Journal of the Lake Superior Region*, 1 (2013): 30, notes Stakel's role in trying to maintain funding for the Ishpeming YMCA during the Great Depression.

<sup>136</sup> *Caspian: The Caring City*, 32, 35.

<sup>137</sup> "Oscar Edward Olson: A Biography," 10, Folder 1, Box 3, MS 71-42A, Oscar Edward Olson Papers, Bentley Library, Ann Arbor, Mich.

<sup>138</sup> Recollections of Harry E. Larsen, *Quinnesec*, 51. See also Marcia Bernhardt, ed., *Men, Mines and Memories: Iron Mining in Iron County, Michigan* (Caspian, Mich.: Iron County Museum, 2001), 26 (May 1974 interview with Mrs. Walter Hawke, whose husband was a miner) and Donald Gerry to Stewart Holbrook, n.d. (but Holbrook reply was Oct. 11, 1938), 28. Stakel, at Republic, made use of loyal employees to hand out election materials, set up observers across from the polling station to identify who had voted, and hired sleighs to carry ballots to those who had not yet voted. See Stakel, *Memoirs*, 77-79.

<sup>139</sup> H. F. Ellard to John H. Bush, Nov. 7, 1905, Folder 3, Box 4, RG 76-90, Cleveland-Cliffs Land Department Papers, Archives of Michigan, Northern Michigan University Repository, Marquette, Mich.

<sup>140</sup> For examples see CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports & Statistics, 1910*, v. 1, pt. 3, 108, Item 2093, CIMC-CCIC; *ibid.*, 1905, sect. 4, 44, Item 2080; and *ibid.*, 1900, sect 1, 58, Item 2064.

<sup>141</sup> CCIC, *Agents' Annual Reports & Statistics, 1901*, v. 1, sec. 2, 32, Item 2067, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>142</sup> Moulton, "Sociological Side," 92; Moulton, "Sanitation," 42.

<sup>143</sup> CCIC, *Annual Report of General Manager, Ore Mining Department, for year ending Dec. 31, 1945*, 616, Item 2016, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>144</sup> CCIC, *Annual Report of General Manager, Ore Mining Department, for year ending Dec. 31, 1945*, 629, Item 2016, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>145</sup> "Housing Report for Oglebay-Norton," 26, 38, and Taylor, "Montreal Mining Co. Improvements Report," 7, MMC, WiHS.

<sup>146</sup> Arthur E. Puotinen, "Finnish Radicals and Religion in Midwestern Mining Towns, 1865-1914," Ph.D. dissertation, University of Chicago, 1973, 83, 144.

<sup>147</sup> Transcript of interview with Mrs. Ethel Hocking, August 24, 1972, Debra E. Bernhardt transcripts, Bentley Historical Library, Ann Arbor, Mich. The interview is reproduced in *Caspian: Caring City*, 31-32. The daughter of an Italian miner, commenting on the Montreal Mining Company's paternalistic program, declared "They [employees] were happy." See Russell and Emma Penrose, *The Underground Iron Ore Mines* (v. 1, The Immigrants – The Penrose, Losero, and Samuel Peterson Families of Iron County, Wisconsin and Gogebic County, Michigan) (Seguin, Texas: by the author, 1995), 3.33. Russell Penrose, *Montreal The City Beautiful: Montreal, Iron County, Wisconsin: An Iron Ore Mining and Residential Community, Circa about 1900-1982* (n.p.: by the author, 1995), 4, commented on the "deep sense of comfort and security" that came from "knowing the company and all families in town had a mutual interest and desire to assure the well being of everyone."

<sup>148</sup> CCIC, *Minute Book, 1932-1936*, Dec. 16, 1932 entry, Cliffs Natural Resources headquarters, Cleveland, Ohio.

<sup>149</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of the General Manager, 1939*, 572, Item 2010, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>150</sup> *Ibid.*, 1931, Item 2002, 42; *ibid.* 1932, Item 2003, 31-32, 166.

<sup>151</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Annual Report of the General Manager, 1934*, 36, Item 2005, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>152</sup> For example, CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Report of the General Manager, 1936*, 47, Item 2007, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>153</sup> Robert Joseph Goodman, "Ishpeming, Michigan: A Functional Study of a Mining Community," Ph.D. dissertation, Northwestern University, 1948, 113.

<sup>154</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Report of the General Manager, 1932*, 380, Item 2003, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>155</sup> *Ibid.*, 379.

<sup>156</sup> Significantly, the United Steelworkers had greater difficulty in organizing Cleveland-Cliffs, the company with the most extensive paternalistic program on the Michigan iron ranges, than in organizing employees in other mining companies. See Reynolds, *Iron Will: Cleveland-Cliffs and the Mining of Iron Ore, 1847-2006* (Detroit, Mich.: Wayne State University Press, 2011), 149.

<sup>157</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Report of the General Manager, 1946*, 1-2, Item 2017, CIMC-CCIC.

<sup>158</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Report of the General Manager, 1954*, 441, Item 2025, CIMC-CCIC..

<sup>159</sup> *Ibid.*, 468; *ibid.*, 1951, 1, 512, Item 2022, for hospital.; *ibid.*, 1952, 446, 470, Item 2023, for visiting nurses. In 1946 the Penn Mining Company sold its hospital to the city of Norway for a nominal sum (William J. Cummings, "Columbia Hospital," *Dickinson Diggings: The Quarterly Publication of the Dickinson County Genealogical Society*, 21, no. 2 (May 2002): 1).

<sup>160</sup> "Oscar Edward Olson: A Biography," 10-11.

<sup>161</sup> CCIC, Ore Mining Department, *Report of the General Manager, 1949*, 574, Item 2020, CIMC-CCIC.